

Edmonton Historical Board

DATE/TIME: Wednesday, March 25, 2015

LOCATION: Prince of Wales Armouries Heritage Centre, Jefferson Room

Minutes

These minutes were approved on April 22, 2015 by the Edmonton Historical Board

Chair

Recording Secretary

Attending:

Michael Boire Darlene Fisher
 Gayle Simonson Barbara Hilden
 Erin McDonald Kyle Witiw
 Leslie Chevalier
 Marilyn Assheton-Smith

Archives Staff:

Sonia Caligiuri, EHB Support
 Kathryn Ivany, City Archivist

Guests:

David Johnston, Principal Heritage Planner

Community Member(s):
 Jesse Watson

Regrets:

Sean Moir
 Ana Laura Pauchulo
 Helen Cheung
 Danielle Metcalfe-Chenail
 Robert Geldart

Agenda Item	Action	Person(s) Responsible	Date Due
1. Welcome and Chair's Remarks	Call to order at 5:08 p.m. Warm welcome to everyone.	▪ Erin	
2. Approval of Agenda	Changes to the Agenda: - 3d) Procedural Information will now be "a" -There are 9 motions for HRRP not 10 -3d: should read March 23 not 26 Moved: Leslie Second: Gayle Approved	▪ Erin	
3. Approval of Minutes	Moved: Kyle Second: Barbara	▪ Erin	

	Approved		
4. Items for Discussion			
a) Procedural Information: Meeting structure with community members present	If community members are present and request to speak at EHB meeting: the report/presentation will be held; community member(s) will be given the opportunity to speak; motion(s)/deliberation will take place.	▪ Erin	
b) Motion: EHB's Naming Committee Representative	The EHB requires a representative to the Naming Committee. Naming Committee meets every 4 th Tuesday of the month at 4:15. -Leslie volunteered to be the representative until the new Board members are approved; new members to be asked if willing/able to be the representative for the rest of the one year term. Motion: That Leslie Chevalier be the Edmonton Historical Board's representative to the Naming Committee Moved: Michael Second: Gayle Approved	• Erin	
c) Follow-up: Appointment Report presentation to Community Services Committee, March 5	-Report was submitted as it had been developed with the additional skill sets decided upon by EHB -Focus was on the successes despite the large number of member turn-over -Councillors were happy with work done and with P&A event; alluded to recruitment process; have received 30 applications for the 2 vacancies. -Erin suggested that those who are not successful could still be contacted to sit on committees as Members at Large	▪ Erin	
d) Information: Annual Report presentation to Community Services Committee, March 23, 2015	-Again, Erin highlighted the successes despite the high number of member turn-over -Historian Laureate has done an excellent job in promoting Edmonton -Council had a few questions such as: if EHB had appropriate resources to do work in new fiscal year; discrepancies in number of properties approved by HRRP and those approved by EHB (Newton Inventory); if EHB/Planners are informed of changes to	▪ Erin	

	<p>houses on the Inventory of Historic Resources. -Report was well received; Councillors happy with the work done and thankful to the EHB members.</p>		
5. Board Committee Reports			
<p>a) Historical Resources Review Panel</p>	<p>-Report attached Motion: that the Oberg Block, 12715-118 Street, be added to the Inventory of Historic Resources. Moved: Michael Second: Barbara Approved (unanimously)</p> <p>Motion: that the Elm Park School, 12920-116 Street, be added to the Inventory of Historic Resources. -Jesse Watson requested to speak. Mr. Watson spoke to the community context and area in which the building is located and not to focus only on the architecture. Moved: Michael Second: Marilyn Approved (6 for, 2 (Leslie and Barbara) opposed)</p> <p>Motion: that the Gagne Residence, 13020-117 Street, be added to the Inventory of Historic Resources. Moved: Michael Second: Barbara Approved (unanimously)</p> <p>Motion: that the Coatta Residence, 12755-119 Street, be added to the Inventory of Historic Resources. Moved: Michael Second: Barbara Approved (unanimously)</p> <p>Motion: that the Olynyk Residence, 12934-115 Street, be added to the Inventory of Historic Resources.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Barbara 	

	<p>Moved: Michael Second: Barbara Approved (unanimously)</p> <p>Motion: that the Snatynchuk Residence, 11512-130 Avenue, be added to the Inventory of Historic Resources. Moved: Michael Second: Barbara Approved (unanimously)</p> <p>Motion: that the Coates Residence, 13068-115 Street, be added to the Inventory of Historic Resources. Moved: Michael Second: Barbara Approved (unanimously)</p> <p>Motion: that the Chalmers United Church, 12315-132 Avenue, be added to the Inventory of Historic Resources. Moved: Michael Second: Barbara Approved (unanimously)</p> <p>Motion: that the Glad Tidings Centre Church, 13020-114 Street, be added to the Inventory of Historic Resources. Moved: Michael Second: Barbara Approved (unanimously)</p>		
b) Heritage Outreach Committee	-Report attached	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Leslie 	
c) Plaques and Awards Committee	<p>The Committee is working on the remaking of missing and/or damaged plaques, the P&A is requesting that the EHB consider remaking three this year.</p> <p>Motion: That the EHB approve the re-manufacturing of 3 damaged plaques: Sarah McLellan Residence, James Rutherford</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Kyle 	

	Residence, and the William Blakey Residence Moved: Kyle Second: Leslie Approved		
6. Other Reports and Updates			
a) Heritage Planners Report	Report attached	▪ Robert	
b) City Archivist's Report	Report attached	▪ Kathryn	
c) Historian Laureate Report	-Email was circulated and attached	▪ Danielle	
d) Naming Committee	-No report at this time as Marilyn was unable to attend the last meeting. Sonia has received information from Committee to be circulated via email	▪ Marilyn	
e) EDHS	-Workshop held here was well attended -AGM and John Rowand night will be on April 14 at the U of A's Faculty Club; guest speaker Dr. Pat McCormack	▪ Gayle	
f) NAPDA	-No report at this time	▪ Marilyn	
g) EHC	-Work continues with the City Museums initiative -Annual Report and AGM; still looking for nominations for Board members	▪ Kathryn	
h) Fort Edmonton Park	-Meeting held on March 9 -Presentation on land area and importance to Aboriginal Peoples -Sweat Lodge will be adjacent to FEP- first in an urban setting; scheduled to be concluded by 2017 -May 16-Park re-opening	▪ Darlene	
7. Other Business			
a) Administrative Support	-No update at this time	▪ Sonia	
b) Building Agenda for Next Meeting	-Final meeting of this term; 2015-16 Committee roster to be finalized and approved	▪ Erin	
8. Adjournment	Moved by Kyle at 7:01	▪ Erin	

- **Next Meeting: Wednesday April 22, 2015 at 5:00 p.m.** in the POWA Jefferson Room
- **Please bring:** Your agenda, meeting minutes, committee reports
- **Please read:** Your agenda, meeting minutes, committee reports

Historic Resources Review Panel
Report to Edmonton Historical Board
March 25, 2015

The HRRP met Tuesday March 10, 2015.

The Panel heard a presentation by **Donald Luxton & Associates** on the **Calder Neighbourhood Context** and proposed **Calder Historic Resources Inventory** and received their report. Members of the public were present but did not ask to speak and left after the presentation.

The Panel discussed the 10 properties proposed (the comments and page numbers are from the draft **Municipal Heritage Planner's Mandatory Documentation** for each property) with Joe Friedel, Member-at-Large, leading the deliberations, resulting in the motions as follows:

The Panel recommends the following 9 buildings be added to the Inventory:

- **Oberg Block:** "Highly significant" (p.14), "has potential for alterations to be reversed" (p.20)
- **Elm Park School:** "Highly valued as purpose-built school" (p.11), "high degree of integrity" (p.19)
- **Gagne Residence:** "One of the earliest intact residences" (p.8), "high degree of integrity" (p.15)
- **Coatta Residence:** "High quality representation of residences constructed to house... railway workers." (p.8), "first location of Nazarene church" (p.9) "Maintains all the aspects of integrity" (p.15)
- **Olynyk Residence:** "Highly intact and striking example of an Arts and Crafts style bungalow" (p.8), "high degree of integrity" (p.15)
- **Snatynchuk Residence:** "Elegant representative of an Arts and Crafts style residence with modest detailing" (p.7), "high degree of integrity", "good condition" (p.14)
- **Coates Residence:** "Representative of the diversity of residential development" (p.18), "maintains all the aspects of integrity necessary for it to convey its significance/heritage value" (p.27)
- **Chalmers United Church:** "Longtime and ongoing association... in the Calder neighbourhood" (p.10), "valued as a prominent example of Modern religious architecture" (p.10-11), "Maintains all the aspects of integrity" (p.17)
- **Glad Tidings Centre Church:** "Representative of the cultural diversity drawn to the neighbourhood from the CNR railway yard" (p.8), "highly valued as an embodiment of a successful social youth movement" (p.9), "Apart from a few changes... retained a high level of integrity" (p.16)

The Panel tabled the following residence to obtain further information for the next meeting

- Lane Residence: "Distinctive clinker brick cladding" (p.7), "not original", "added", "enclosed" (p.15)

Proposed motions for EHB meeting March 25, 2015

Motion: That the Oberg Block, 12716 – 118 Street NW, be added to the Inventory of Historic Resources

Motion: That the Elm Park School, 12920 – 116 Street NW, be added to the Inventory of Historic Resources

Motion: That the Gagne Residence, 13020 – 117 Street NW, be added to the Inventory of Historic Resources

Motion: That the Coatta Residence, 12755 – 119 Street NW, be added to the Inventory of Historic Resources

Motion: That the Olynyk Residence at 12934 – 115 Street NW, be added to the Inventory of Historic Resources

Motion: That the Snatynchuk Residence, 11512 – 130 Avenue NW, be added to the Inventory of Historic Resources

Motion: That the Coates Residence, 13068 – 115 Street NW, be added to the Inventory of Historic Resources

Motion: That the Chalmers United Church, 12315 – 132 Avenue NW, be added to the Inventory of Historic Resources

Motion: That the Glad Tidings Centre Church, 13020 – 114 Street NW, be added to the Inventory of Historic Resources

Chair's comments:

- If the materials were made available prior to meetings on which a decision is to be made it would improve outcomes. A week to review the materials, preferably in electronic format, is proposed.
- The new/old meeting process (as shared by Sonia Caligiuri on March 9, 2015 via email) was not strictly adhered to. Given the nature of the deliberations, the use of a "committee of the whole" for each item followed by a motion (and any debate on the motion) and vote may be suitable. This is in effect what took place in the March 10 meeting. (for details on "committee of the whole" see <http://ibbi.seadeo.net/docs/rulesord/whole.htm>, accessed March 20 '15)

Respectfully submitted by: Michael Boire, HRRP Meeting Chair

Heritage Outreach Committee
Report to Edmonton Historical Board
March 25, 2015

Building Heritage Newsletter - Expect a new look. This has delayed publication somewhat but should be ready by May.

Edmonton Heritage Homeowners' Association – Next Wine and Whine at the Capt. John Hall House at 7696-Jasper Avenue. It is to be hosted on Thursday, April 23, 2015.

Edmonton's Architectural Website - Gayle reported that she had found another teacher to help out. This person has since bowed out due to her perceived value of the website to Alberta teachers. Gayle and Linda Rae Carson will continue to work on this project.

FaceBook Page - Kyle continues to update the page with interesting and relevant posts.

Panel discussion - Kyle has looked into having the EHB sponsored event at the Yellowhead Brewery, a designated building. It will be held on a Wednesday evening during the Doors Open week. He's anticipating a \$400 fee for the room, and providing food for up to 126 people (space limit). The heritage planners will present a shortened version of their PowerPoint presentation. One or more heritage homeowners, and hopefully the owner of the Brewery will share their experiences. Notes from discussion attached.

Heritage Forward - Notes on the panel discussion hosted by Heritage Forward at the Central Masonic Hall on Monday, March 2nd are attached. One disappointment voiced about the discussion by the panel was the lack of heritage and it's role in MNO and SDAB. Heritage wasn't really mentioned until an audience member brought it up during the Q and A.

HOC Get Together - The Committee will get together in late April to celebrate the work done in the last year as two of its members will be leaving the EHB. The April HOC meeting had been cancelled.

Respectfully submitted by: Leslie Chevalier, HOC Chair

**Heritage Forward - Old YEG Panel Discussion II –
Infill and the MNO- Notes**
Monday, March 2, 2015

The panelists were:

Ken Cantor, Qualico

David Murray, Architect

David Johnston, Heritage Planner, City of Edmonton

Bev Zubot, Edmonton Federation of Community Leagues

Doors opened at 5:30 PM and the discussion began shortly after 6 PM with Tim Marriott presiding. Just before, Jody, of the Friends of the McDougall Church, announced that a steering committee was meeting that night to discuss options for the church. The arts community values it as a performing space for its superior acoustics and seating capacity of a thousand. Anyone interested in saving the building should google Friends of the McDougall for more information about how to get involved.

About 115 to 125 attended the panel discussion on Infill and the MNO. The following is a summary of the questions asked and the panelists' answers.

How would you define neighbourhood character?

David Murray - There is concern over the loss of character through infill (which is still the best way to allay urban sprawl). The oldest neighbourhoods in Edmonton are not particularly homogeneous anyway and have styles that range from Edwardian to the present. There is some question about how well new buildings fit into what is already there. Streetscapes are as important in neighbourhoods as buildings; rows of elms or ash and the pattern of roadway, boulevard, verge and yard are what hold a neighbourhood together. There are some more homogeneous areas such as Westmount. The characteristics there are Edwardian porches, large front doors, and steps in scale; from yard to porch to house. Character is an intangible aspect and what is valued in each different neighbourhood.

Ken Cantor - Character is comfortable and allows an image to come to mind when a particular neighbourhood is mentioned. It gives a sense of community; it is not just form. Streetscapes are important. It's important to think about today's decisions in terms of the future to 2060. It takes 40 years to build a tree.

Bev Zubot - Landscaping is very important and there are no by-laws regarding it. There is no attempt to save trees; nor are new ones being planted to replenish the ones being cut down. Common spaces, parks, schools, halls, community buildings define a community.

David Johnston - Splitting lots makes growing large trees difficult. They don't fit. The rhythm of frontages, lot widths and set backs are important defining characteristics. A concern is the encroachment of front access in older neighbours where you get cars crossing sidewalks.

What is the role of the subdivision appeal board (SDAB)?

Bev Zubot- Need fair balance of property owner and neighbours to be sure that neighbourhood amenities are not unduly impacted. Ensure bylaws are abided by (except in unusual circumstances).

David Johnston - There was the feeling that it's too late in the process if something is brought to SDAB. Applicant acting as zoning allows. Board needs to be cognizant of broader planning objectives. Focus of zoning can be issue for administration. Broader roles must be understood.

David Murray - SDAB is fallible. They can be challenged when they make poor decisions; there are legal options (though expensive). It is important to act collectively against them.

Bev Zubot - SDAB requires no contextual information (site visits, pictures, etc.) before they make a decision.

Ken Cantor - Something's broken. Every plan should not go to the appeal board. Zoning by-laws aren't capable of giving us enough regarding form. SDAB is a very adversarial process in which nobody wins.

What about neighbourhood density and mature neighbourhoods?

Bev Zubot - No guarantee that low density neighbourhoods will remain so. The city can double density without decreasing character though. This would take very careful planning and by law changes. The changes to the height regulations mean that someone could build a chalet style building that was significantly higher than a regularly pitched roof would be, thereby changing the skyline without changing height restrictions. Using more garage and garden suites would add to the density without changing character. The subdivision of large lots will change the rhythm of the streetscapes. We need an MNO with teeth. Architectural overlays can be used; also landscape overlays.

David Johnston - It's a political direction to direct 25% of growth into the centre of Edmonton. The heritage character perspective suggests that "nodes" with lots of existing character be left. Infill should only be in neighbourhoods that have already been significantly altered. Focus the densification.

David Murray - Concerned about increasing height limits; where is the impetus coming from?

Bev Zubot - Developers want steep roofed homes. City zones could be created for this.

David Murray - Overshadowing of neighbour's property must be a concern. MNOs lowered heights. There is a concern about style overlays as it's wrong to impose style. Guide lines lead to better qualities of architecture, which would allow for contemporary building fit to the scale of older neighbourhoods. Allow for styles and tastes within a range of elements; front entrances, porches, balconies. More effort could be made to envision more contemporary styles. Don't create "fake history". Many of these new buildings on Whyte have not been done well. There is a problem with the quality of architecture. Many developers, rather than architects, design houses.

Ken Cantor - Have zoning that says that area will increase in density over time. Homeowners should have some certainty. The city doesn't have the infrastructure in the downtown to allow for 25% increase in density; 10-15% at most. Zoning doesn't pay enough attention to the building code; there's not enough space for venting soffits leading to black mould in some cases.

Infill guidelines?

David Johnston - These are used by council as a tool to help those who want to develop. They are flexible, open to interpretation.

Ken Cantor - Change "guidelines" to regulations. He doesn't like the negotiable element. Both sides of the issues (developers and community members) should be able to rely on a set of rules.

Bev Zubot - Some guidelines have been put into by laws. Many have not. Parties need to know what can be done. There need to be transition rules; the difference between highest and lowest buildings. The city has used the guidelines to increase density without increasing the quality of buildings.

Tim closed the discussion by repeating key phrases; "streetscapes", "the whole city has a responsibility for what the city should look like", "density has increased without increasing quality".

A lively question and answer session ensued.

Heritage Planners' Report
Report to Edmonton Historical Board
March 25, 2015

Update on the Historic Resources Inventory for the Calder Neighbourhood: HRRP started their review and evaluation of the first phase of the proposed Inventory for Calder on March 10. The remaining buildings will be presented and considered on April 14.

For the Glenora Neighbourhood Historic Resources Inventory, our submission to the Province's Municipal Historic Partnership Program for a \$30,000 grant has been tabled until May for a decision by ARHF because of the Provincial budget coming out on March 26.

Notice of Intention to Designate the Canada Packers Chimney Stack was passed by Executive Committee on March 24. The Notice is scheduled for the next City Council meeting on April 15th. Bylaws to Designate the following buildings are scheduled for April 28, 2015:

- Cameron Block on 97 Street
- St. Josaphat Cathedral
- McKay Avenue School
- Edmonton 1881 School (on same property as McKay Avenue School)

Potential upcoming designations:

- Mayor Sheppard Residence (Strathcona)
- First Baptist Church (Downtown)
- Rose Residence (Highlands)
- Mah Building (Alberta Avenue)

Buena Vista Building (former Glenora B & B) will now be a part of a proposed DC1 zoning. It will not be designated, as the building will be dismantled and reassembled as part of the new development. The DC1 will contain a number of specific elements related to heritage.

McDougall Church: City Council has asked that team of experts be formed to work on a solution to save the building and bring it back to City Council by the end of this year.

Molson Brewery: The owner is now considering two rehabilitation options for Building 11 – first, complete rehabilitation of the entire building, and second, mothballing of the third and fourth levels. The City has commissioned a consultant to review the financial pro formas of the overall development to provide advice on what level of heritage grant would be required to make the building rehabilitation financially feasible.

Infill: The March 24 Executive Committee meeting featured several items related to the City's Evolving Infill strategy. Several comments were made by Councillors that the existing character and context of mature neighbourhoods is being negatively affected by unsympathetic infill.

Character areas: Robert and David spent a recent morning with Elise Stolte at the *Edmonton Journal*, touring some of the seven identified heritage character areas. She is intending on producing a two-pagespread in an upcoming Saturday edition profiling the seven areas, and outlining what elements make them unique, and why heritage character is valuable.

David participated as a member of the panel discussion at the March 2 Heritage Forward! event at the Central Masonic Temple. The topic was “Historic Neighbourhoods and the Mature Neighbourhood Overlay”.

The Heritage Management Unit will be providing three heritage walking tours as part of the upcoming Federation of Canadian Municipalities conference in Edmonton on June 5 and 7. All three tours are sold out.

We have submitted a conference presentation proposal for the upcoming Heritage Energized – Heritage Canada National Trust conference in Calgary in October. Our proposals include a presentation on the evolution of 104 Street, and a presentation on the impacts of infill on established heritage communities, and innovative ways to address the issue.

Neon Sign Museum: We have (finally) entered into a formal written Agreement with the Alberta Sign Association for on-going support to the Museum. The Agreement will provide the ASA with yearly funding to assist in sign rehabilitation and installation. We are hoping this will get the momentum back with the Museum, and see some new signs installed before the end of the year. Interpretative panels for the eight existing signs will be installed this spring.

Work is progressing in preparation of the spring issue of the Built Heritage Newsletter. We will be sending you a new design concept of the newsletter to HOC and EHB.

Respectfully submitted by: Robert Geldart, David Johnston and Scott Ashe

City Archivist's Report
Report to Edmonton Historical Board
March 25, 2015

The major work affecting the Archives and the public this month was the revamping of the acquisitions/accession policy and the creation of an accessions committee. This moves towards new best practice in Archives to document acquisition decision for records coming into the collection from private donors.

The Archives has had a practicum student working for the past month on researching and writing content for a new virtual exhibit on the 1908-1912 Incline Railway. We have also been supervising a practicum student working out of the Aviation Museum's archives to assist with their collections management.

The Bruun photography exhibit was launched March 6th and continues on the west catwalk Art Wall until April 10th.

The City Archives and the Prince of Wales Armouries Heritage Centre have been involved in a number of educational experiences during the last month. We hosted the Edmonton District Historical Society's Workshop (where the Historian Laureate participated as presenter) on Family and Community History and Melissa McCarthy, Reference Archivist, led a course on Genealogy Resources at the City Archives.

The City Archivist also assisted the Edmonton Heritage Council with their Pathways initiative focusing on Edmonton City as Museum Project (ECAMP) by leading a walking tour in Rosssdale to highlight the layers of history extant in some places in the city.

Respectfully submitted by: Kathryn Ivany, City Archivist